

THE FATE OF TWIN STARS ON THE UNSTABLE BRANCH

November 16, 2021



Penn State University



Introduction O	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars 0000	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods 0000	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion
INTRO	DUCTION						

The fate of twin stars on the unstable branch

EQUATION OF STATE (EOS) OF DENSE MATTER



QUANTUM CHROMODYNAMICS (QCD) PHASE DIAGRAM





¹Baym et al., Rept.Prog.Phys. 81 (2018) 5, 056902



QUANTUM CHROMODYNAMICS (QCD) PHASE DIAGRAM





¹Baym et al., Rept.Prog.Phys. 81 (2018) 5, 056902



QUANTUM CHROMODYNAMICS (QCD) PHASE DIAGRAM





¹Baym et al., Rept.Prog.Phys. 81 (2018) 5, 056902

Introduction 00	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars 0000	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods 0000	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion
DENSE	MATTER EOS						

The problem is usually approached by treating the hadronic and quark phases under separate models



One then interpolates between the two phases and matches the EOSs under some construction

²Baym et al., Rept.Prog.Phys. 81 (2018) 5, 056902

Introduction	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion
00	000000	0000	00000	0000	0000	0000	000

HADRONIC EOS



Many-body approach

- Use understanding of symmetric nuclear/ pure neutron matter at $\ensuremath{n_0}$
- Determine nucleon-nucleon potentials from scattering data associated with symmetric nuclei
- Solve many-body Schrödinger equation in the presence of these potentials
- Expand in terms of proton fraction

$$E_B(x, n_B) \approx E(0, n_B) - 4(1 - x)n_B S_B + \cdots,$$
 (1)

Relativistic mean-field approach

Write down EFT including relevant d.o.f (nucleons, electrons, muons, ...) interacting via exchange of mesons (scalar, vector, ...)

$$\mathcal{L} = \bar{\psi}(i\gamma^{\mu}\partial_{\mu} - m_B)\psi + g_{\sigma}\sigma\bar{\psi}\psi - g_{\omega}\bar{\psi}\gamma^{\mu}\omega_{\mu}\psi + \cdots$$
(2)

Next, integrate out mediators. Assuming the mediator fields can be replaced with their mean field (static values) and extract an EOS

$$T^{\mu\nu} = \frac{\partial \mathcal{L}}{\partial(\partial_{\mu}\phi_{\alpha})}\partial^{\nu}\phi_{\alpha} - g^{\mu\nu}\mathcal{L}$$
(3)

7

Introduction	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion
00	0000000	0000	00000	0000	0000	0000	000
						1	

QUARK EOS



Bag models:

Treat entire quark phase as a bag of non-interacting quarks. Takes into accound the bare quark kinetic energy density ε_Q (non- interacting Fermi gas) and the bag constant *B*.

$$\varepsilon_Q = 2n_c n_f \int_0^{p_F} \frac{d^3 p}{(2\pi^3)} |p| \tag{4}$$

Bag constant *B*: difference in energy density between non-perturbative (QCD ground state) and perturbative (devoid of all particles and condensates) vacua. Total energy density is then

$$\varepsilon = \varepsilon_Q + B \tag{5}$$

Relativistic mean-field approach (Nambu-Jona-Lasinio models)

Write down EFT including relevant d.o.f (quarks) interacting via exchange of particles (scalar, vector, ...)

$$\mathcal{L} = \bar{q}(i\gamma^{\mu}\partial_{\mu} - m_q + \mu_q\gamma^0)q + \mathcal{L}^{(4)} + \mathcal{L}^{(6)}$$
(6)

Extract EOS in mean-field approach

Introduction	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion
00	0000000	0000	00000	0000	0000	0000	000

FROM HADRONS TO QUARKS



Maxwell construction:

Impose local charge neutrality within the system. This leads to strict separation of phases (sharp interface between quark and hadronic regions). Transition is isobaric and can happen over a finite range in densities, defined by

$$P^{H}(\mu_{B}^{H}, \mu_{e}^{H}) = P^{Q}(\mu^{Q}, \mu_{e}^{Q})$$
(7)

$$\mu_B^H = 3\mu^Q \tag{8}$$

 μ_e is discontinuous across interface

Gibbs construction

Impose global charge neutrality over entire system (quarks + hadrons). Allows for mixed phase regions. all quantities are continuous accross the transition

$$P^{H}(\mu_{B}^{H},\mu_{e}^{H}) = P^{Q}(\mu^{Q},\mu_{e}^{Q})$$
(9)

$$u_B^H = 3\mu^Q \tag{10}$$

$$\mu_e^H = \mu_e^Q \tag{11}$$

Many interpolation techniques, e.g.: high-order polynomial interpolation, spectral expansions, ...

Introduction	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion
00	000000	0000	00000	0000	0000	0000	000

OBSERVATIONAL CONSTRAINTS



³Annala et al., arXiv:2105.05132v2 (2021)

TWIN STARS

Introduction	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion
00	000000	0000	00000	0000	0000	0000	000

HYBRID STARS -- THE THIRD FAMILY OF COMPACT STARS

PHYSICAL REVIEW

VOLUME 172, NUMBER 5

25 AUGUST 1968

Equation of State at Supranuclear Densities and the Existence of a Third Family of Superdense Stars*†

ULRICH H. GERLACH^{\$} Palmer Physical Laboratory, Princeton University, Princeton, New Jersey (Received 14 December 1967; revised manuscript received 10 May 1968)

This paper presents a method for deducing the equation of state of "cold" matter at supranuclear densities from astronomical data. In particular, from the masses and the radii of a sequence of superdense stars composed of degenerate matter, one can determine the equation of state. The relationship between the equation of state and the mass-radius curve is used to construct an equation of state that allows a third family of superdense stars.

Introduction	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion
00	000000	0000	00000	0000	0000	0000	000

PHYSICAL REVIEW VOLUME 172, NUMBER 5

25 AUGUST 1968

First family: White dwarfs

 $M: 0.3 - 1.0 \,\mathrm{M}_{\odot}$ $R: 7000 \,\mathrm{km}$ $C \sim 0.0001$

Second family: Neutron stars

 $\begin{array}{l} M: 1.0-2.0\,\mathrm{M}_\odot\\ R: 10-15\,\mathrm{km}\\ C\sim 0.2 \end{array}$

Third family: Hybrid stars

 $\begin{array}{l} M\gtrsim M_{\rm NS} \\ R\lesssim R_{\rm NS} \\ C\gtrsim C_{\rm NS} \end{array}$

Equation of State at Supranuclear Densities and the Existence of a Third Family of Superdense Stars*†

ULRICH H. GERLACH Palmer Physical Laboratory, Princeton University, Princeton, New Jersey (Received 14 December 1967; revised manuscript received 10 May 1968)

This paper presents a method for deducing the equation of state of "cold" matter at supranuclear densities from astronomical data. In particular, from the masses and the radii of a sequence of supercense stars comoged of degenerate matter, one can determine the equation of state. The relationship between the equation of state and the mass-radius curve is used to construct an equation of state that allows a third family of supercense stars.



⁴K. Schertler et al., Nucl. Phys. A677 (2000) 463, [astro-ph/0001467]

Introduction	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion
00	000000	0000	00000	0000	0000	0000	000

PHYSICAL REVIEW VOLUME 172, NUMBER 5

25 AUGUST 1968

Equation of State at Supranuclear Densities and the Existence of a Third Family of Superdense Stars*†

ULRICH H. GERLACH Palmer Physical Laboratory, Princeton University, Princeton, New Jersey (Received 14 December 1967; revised manuscript received 10 May 1968)

This paper presents a method for deducing the equation of state of "cold" matter at appraunchear densities from astronomical data. In particular, from the masses and the radii of a sequence of superdense stars comopeed of degenerate matter; one can determine the equation of state. The relationship between the equation of state and the mass-ndius curve is used to construct an equation of state that allows a third family of superdense stars.



First family: White dwarfs

 $\begin{array}{l} M:\,0.3-1.0\,\mathrm{M}_\odot\\ R:\,7000\,\mathrm{km}\\ C\sim0.0001 \end{array}$

Second family: Neutron stars

$$\begin{split} M &: 1.0 - 2.0 \, \mathrm{M}_\odot \\ R &: 10 - 15 \, \mathrm{km} \\ C &\sim 0.2 \end{split}$$

Third family: Hybrid stars

 $\begin{array}{l} M\gtrsim M_{\rm NS} \\ R\lesssim R_{\rm NS} \\ C\gtrsim C_{\rm NS} \end{array}$

⁵K. Schertler et al., Nucl. Phys. A677 (2000) 463, [astro-ph/0001467]

Introduction	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion
00	0000000	0000	00000	0000	0000	0000	000
						/	

PHYSICAL REVIEW

VOLUME 172, NUMBER 5

25 AUGUST 1968

First family: White dwarfs

 $M: 0.3 - 1.0 \,\mathrm{M}_{\odot}$ $R: 7000 \,\mathrm{km}$ $C \sim 0.0001$

Second family: Neutron stars

 $\begin{array}{l} M: 1.0-2.0\,\mathrm{M}_\odot\\ R: 10-15\,\mathrm{km}\\ C\sim 0.2 \end{array}$

Third family: Hybrid stars

 $\begin{array}{l} M\gtrsim M_{\rm NS} \\ R\lesssim R_{\rm NS} \\ C\gtrsim C_{\rm NS} \end{array}$

Equation of State at Supranuclear Densities and the Existence of a Third Family of Superdense Stars*†

ULRICH H. GERLACH Palmer Physical Laboratory, Princeton University, Princeton, New Jersey (Received 14 December 1967; revised manuscript received 10 May 1968)

This paper presents a method for deducing the equation of state of "cold" matter at supramucloar densities from astronomical data. In particular, from the masses and the radii of a sequence of superdense stars composed of degenerate matter, one can determine the equation of state. The relationship between the equation of state and the mass-radius curve is used to construct an equation of state that allows a third family of superdense stars.



Twin stars:

"Due to partially overlapping mass regions of the neutron star branch and the branch of the third family it is possible that non-identical stars of the same mass can exist. Such pairs are refered to as 'neutron star twins'"

⁵K. Schertler et al., Nucl. Phys. A677 (2000) 463, [astro-ph/0001467]

Introduction	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion
00	0000000	0000	00000	0000	0000	0000	000
						/	

PHYSICAL REVIEW

VOLUME 172, NUMBER 5

25 AUGUST 1968

First family: White dwarfs

 $\begin{array}{l} M:\,0.3-1.0\,{\rm M}_\odot\\ R:\,7000\,{\rm km}\\ C\sim 0.0001 \end{array}$

Second family: Neutron stars

$$\begin{split} M &: 1.0 - 2.0 \, \mathrm{M}_\odot \\ R &: 10 - 15 \, \mathrm{km} \\ C &\sim 0.2 \end{split}$$

Third family: Hybrid stars

 $\begin{array}{l} M\gtrsim M_{\rm NS} \\ R\lesssim R_{\rm NS} \\ C\gtrsim C_{\rm NS} \end{array}$

Equation of State at Supranuclear Densities and the Existence of a Third Family of Superdense Stars*

ULRICH H. GERLACH Palmer Physical Laboratory, Princeton University, Princeton, New Jersey (Received 14 December 1967; revised manuscript received 10 May 1968)

This paper presents a method for deducing the equation of state of "cold" matter at supramucloar densities from astronomical data. In particular, from the masses and the radii of a sequence of superdense stars composed of degenerate matter, one can determine the equation of state. The relationship between the equation of state and the mass-radius curve is used to construct an equation of state that allows a third family of superdense stars.



Twin stars: Hybrid stars with the same masses as neutron stars, but smaller radii

Twin stars:

"Due to partially overlapping mass regions of the neutron star branch and the branch of the third family it is possible that non-identical stars of the same mass can exist. Such pairs are refered to as 'neutron star twins'"

⁵K. Schertler et al., Nucl. Phys. A677 (2000) 463, [astro-ph/0001467]

STABILITY: THE TURNING POINT THEOREM

Introduction	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion
00	0000000	0000	0000	0000	0000	0000	000

TURNING POINT THEOREM



⁶K. Schertler et al., Nucl. Phys. A677 (2000) 463, [astro-ph/0001467]

Introduction	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion
00	0000000	0000	00000	0000	0000	0000	000

UNSTABLE TWIN STARS



Introduction	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion
00	0000000	0000	00000	0000	0000	0000	000

UNSTABLE TWIN STARS



For a sequence of stars of constant entropy S and angular momentum J, instability to radial perturbations arises when

$$\left. \frac{\partial M}{\partial \epsilon_c} \right|_{S,J} \le 0 \tag{12}$$





Hybrid hadron-quark stars with the same mass as neutron stars, but with different radii.

The turning point-theorem indicates that stars which satisfy

$$\left. \frac{\partial M}{\partial \epsilon_{\rm c}} \right|_{J,S} \le 0,$$

are susceptible to radial instabilities

Intro 00	duction	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars 0000	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods 0000	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion
Ql	JESTI	ONS						

Some questions we are interested in answering:

- What dynamics can we expect from the evolution of unstable branch hybrid twin stars?
- Does the evolution preferably go toward the hadronic branch? hybrid branch?

• What gravitational wave signals can we expect from the evolution of unstable branch hybrid twin stars?

METHODS

Introduction 00	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars 0000	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods O●OO	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion

METHODS: GENERAL

• We consider parametrizations of two hybrid hadron-quark descriptions of the dense matter EOS.

 \cdot we use a **piecewise polytropic** fit of the $P(\rho)$ functional for each of these EOSs, ensuring that stellar properties are largely unchanged

 \cdot Using these finite sound speed versions of the EOS alleviates problems associated with the numerical evolution of fluid with $c_s=0$



• We construct stars with different amounts of rotation to cover as much of the solution space as possible.

• We evolve these initial data using 3D general relativistic hydrodynamics while inciting different radial perturbations.

Introduction	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion
00	000000	0000	00000	0000	0000	0000	000

METHODS: RADIAL PERTURBATIONS

• We begin all evolutions in one of three ways:

· Equilibrium evolution: no radial perturbations are explicitly excited at the start of evolution

• Positive pressure perturbation: a radial perturbation is excited by increasing the pressure everywhere in the star by a small amount.

• Negative pressure perturbation: a radial perturbation is excited by decreasing the pressure everywhere in the star by some amount. The pressure perturbations take the following form

$$P(t = 0, \mathbf{x}) \longrightarrow (1 + \xi) P(t = 0, \mathbf{x}), \tag{13}$$

where x indicates the spatial coordinates, and ξ is a small number that can be either positive or negative in cases where we add or deplete pressure, respectively.

Introduction	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion
00	0000000	0000	00000	0000	0000	0000	000

METHODS: INITIAL DATA



RESULTS: NON-ROTATING MODELS

Introduction	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion
00	000000	0000	00000	0000	0000	0000	000

NON-ROTATING MODELS: EQUILIBRIUM EVOLUTION AND POSITIVE PRESSURE PERTURBATION

• The model initially contracts, leading to a momentary collapse and increasing in size of the quark core.

• As more matter enters the deconfined phase with relatively high pressure, the collapse is halted and the model **reverts into expansion**.

• Eventually the model settles close to the the twin star at lower densities.

Introduction	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion
00	0000000	0000	00000	0000	0000	0000	000

NON-ROTATING MODELS: EQUILIBRIUM EVOLUTIONS AND POSITIVE PRESSURE PERTURBATIONS

_____ Equilibrium



Introduction	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion
00	000000	0000	00000	0000	0000	0000	000

NON-ROTATING MODELS: PRESSURE DEPLETION



RESULTS: ROTATING MODELS

Introduction	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion
00	000000	0000	00000	0000	0000	0000	000

ROTATING MODELS: PRESSURE DEPLETION

Equilibrium



Introduction	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion
00	000000	0000	00000	0000	0000	0000	000

ROTATING MODELS: GRAVITATIONAL RADIATION

_____ Equilibrium



Introduction	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion
00	000000	0000	00000	0000	0000	0000	000

ROTATING MODELS: DETECTABILITY OF GWS



• At $d_{source} = 10$ kpc, assuming an ideal detector orientation, the gravitational waves associated with the transition from an unstable hybrid star to a stable hadronic star are detectable.

• Likely progenitors of unstable branch hybrid stars are core-collapse supernovae (CCSN) or white dwarf- neutron star mergers. Each of these progenitor systems are expected to produce GWs which peak at lower frequencies:

$$f_{
m peak}^{
m CCSN} \sim 1 \, {
m kHz} \qquad f_{
m peak}^{
m WDNS} \sim 0.01 - 0.1 \, {
m Hz}$$

CONCLUSION

Introduction	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion
00	000000	0000	00000	0000	0000	0000	000

SUMMARY

We have explored the stability of hybrid hadron-quark stars on the unstable branch:

- → Unstable branch hybrid twin stars migrate toward the stable neutron star branch:
 - ightarrow we tested stars accross two EOSs, which sample the wide range of viable hybrid hadron quark stars
 - $\rightarrow~$ we consider several perturbations of different sizes
- → In the time they transition to the stable neutron star branch, the stars undergo strong radial oscillations.
- → Rotating hybrid stars on the unstable branch may produce detectable GW bursts for close-by sources.
- → Future work:
 - → inducing strong radial oscillations in hybrid stars in dynamical capture binaries (e.g. consider eccentric hybrid star mergers)
 - → exciting strong radial oscillations/phase transitions in WDNS binaries. Considering GW signal at different frequencies.

Introduction	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion
00	000000	0000	00000	0000	0000	0000	•00

BONUS: TURNING POINT THEOREM

A STABILITY CRITERION FOR MANY-PARAMETER EQUILIBRIUM FAMILIES

RAFAEL D. SORKIN Institute for Advanced Study, Princeton, NJ Received 1981 November 6; accepted 1982 January 6

ABSTRACT

Theorems are established which let one detect instabilities without recourse to the usual perturbation analysis. The method applies to any system whose stable equilibria maximize a functional 32 at fixed values of one or more parameters E^{-} . It generalizes the "turning point method" by inferring instability from the behavior in equilibrium of the E^{+} and of their conjugate parameters $83/26^{+}$. The "cusp catastrophe" and the black hole equilibrium family illustrate the approach. In connection with the latter, an Appendix proves that the Gibbs free energy is an analytic function of its natural arguments, as would be expected if all the equilibria belonged to a single thermodynamic phase. Subject headings: hydrodynamics — instabilities

- $\rightarrow \mbox{ Let } \mathcal{M}$ be a manifold of "all possible configurations and states" of a system
- $\rightarrow S$ and E are C3 functions on \mathcal{M}
- → Equilibria: X are points in M at which S is an extremum with respect to infinitesimal variations dX along which dE = 0
- \rightarrow Unstable equilibria: X is unstable if each of its neighborhoods contains a state of strictly greater S, at the same E
- → this holds for systems which are characterized by an extremum and whose equilibria fall along a one-parameter sequence (first applied to NSs by Friedman (86))

Introduction	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion
00	000000	0000	00000	0000	0000	0000	000

BONUS: NEWMAN-PENROSE FORMALISM

An Approach to Gravitational Radiation by a Method of Spin Coefficients*

EZRA NEWMAN University of Pittsburgh, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania

ROGER PENROSE† Syracuse University,‡ Syracuse, New York (Received September 29, 1961)

A new approach to general relativity by means of a tetrad or spinor formalism is presented. The sensitial feature of this approach is the consistent use of certain complex linear combinations of Ricci rotation coefficients which give, in effect, the spinor affine connection. It is applied to two problems in radiation theory; a concise proof of a theorem of Goldberg and Sachs and a description of the asymptotic behavior of the Riemann tensor and metric tensor, for outgoing gravitational radiation.

- \rightarrow Focus on s = -2 spin-weighted spherical harmonic decompositions of the Newman-Penrose scalar Ψ_4 .
 - $\rightarrow~$ The coefficients of the spin-weighted decomposition are labeled $\Psi_4^{l,m}$
- → Extract $\Psi_{L}^{l,m}$ from numerical simulations at fixed co-centric spheres increasing radii (typically ranging from $r \sim 50 M$ to $r \sim 200 M$.
- ightarrow We compute the gravitational wave strain from

$$\Psi^4 = \ddot{h}_+ - i\ddot{h}_\times. \tag{14}$$

Introduction 00	Equation of state (EOS) of dense matter	Twin stars 0000	Stability: the turning point theorem	Methods 0000	Results: Non-rotating models	Results: Rotating models	Conclusion
00	000000	0000	00000	0000	0000	0000	000

BONUS: EOS PROPERTIES



- $\rightarrow~$ Both EOSs are modelled by RMF models in the hadronic phase
- ightarrow EOS A4: Originally a 4-segment piecewise polytrope above $n \sim n_0$
- \rightarrow EOS T9: Quark phase based on constant sound speed ($c_s = 1$) parametrization

$$P(\epsilon) = \begin{cases} P_{\rm tr} & \epsilon_{\rm tr}^{\mathsf{T9}_0} \le \epsilon \le 1.9 \epsilon_{\rm tr}^{\mathsf{T9}_0} ,\\ P_{\rm tr} + c_{\rm s}^2(\epsilon - 1.9 \epsilon_{\rm tr}^{\mathsf{T9}_0}) & \epsilon \ge 1.9 \epsilon_{\rm tr}^{\mathsf{T9}_0} , \end{cases}$$
(15)